Center on
GREAT TEACHERS & LEADERS
at American Institutes for Research ■

Mentoring and Induction Toolkit

Mentor Selection Criteria Tally Master Score Sheet

Workbook 2

AIR®
AMERICAN INSTITUTES FOR RESEARCH®

Mentor Selection Criteria Tally Master Score Sheet

Purpose: This resource is part of the *Mentoring and Induction Toolkit* from the Center on Great Teachers and Leaders. This tool helps school and district teams prioritize the criteria they will use when recruiting, selecting, and assigning mentors. Potential selection criteria are organized into five categories: (1) critical elements of effective mentoring, (2) attitude and dispositions, (3) professional competence and experience, (4) communication skills, and (5) interpersonal skills. This tool helps teams prioritize the criteria that matter most to the success of their school or district.

Research on the characteristics and skills of mentors is limited, but some studies suggest that prioritizing knowledge of student assessment (formative and summative) and standards (learning and teaching) are critical elements for successful mentoring.[1] To prioritize criteria when developing mentoring and induction programs in their context, team members may want to consider specific goals of the school and district, the professional culture in their school or district, and evidence from past experience.

This tool was adapted from Tool: Selecting and Assigning Mentors, which is part of Assist Beginning Teachers from the Michigan Department of Education.

Instructions: After each team member has individually rated each criterion, use the **Mentor Selection Criteria Tally Master Score Sheet** to record and sum the scores for each criterion. Discuss the point totals with the team to determine which criteria should be prioritized, revised, or eliminated to create a set of mentor selection criteria customized to the needs of the school or district.

---

[1] Achinstein, B., & Athanases, S. Z. (2006). *Mentors in the making: Developing new leaders for new teachers.* New York, NY: Teachers College Press.

Criteria	Use this column to list the scores of each individual on your team	Add the numbers in the second column for a total score
Critical elements of effective mentoring		
1. Does the mentor candidate effectively use formative assessments to gauge student learning and adjust instruction accordingly?		
2. Does the mentor candidate effectively use summative data to reflect on his/her practices to improve student learning over time?		
3. Does the mentor candidate have a sufficient repertoire of instructional strategies to adjust instruction to meet the needs of diverse learners?		
4. Does the mentor candidate effectively understand and use student learning standards to drive instruction?		
5. Does the mentor candidate have a deep understanding of and capacity to use teaching standards or relevant teaching frameworks to coach beginning teachers toward more effective instruction?		
Attitude and dispositions		
1. Does the mentor candidate exhibit a strong commitment to the profession?		
2. Is the mentor candidate willing to serve as a role model for other teachers?		
3. Is the mentor candidate eager to share information and ideas with colleagues?		
4. Is the mentor candidate reflective and able to learn from mistakes?		
5. Is the mentor candidate willing to accept feedback and make changes to his/her practice?		
6. Is the mentor candidate willing to advocate on behalf of colleagues?		
7. Is the mentor candidate flexible, persistent, resilient, and open-minded?		
8. Does the mentor candidate exhibit good humor and resourcefulness?		
9. Is the mentor candidate willing to participate in training to improve his/her mentoring skills?		
Other:		

Criteria	Use this column to list the scores of each individual on your team	Add the numbers in the second column for a total score
Professional competence and experience		
1. Does the mentor candidate's pedagogical expertise match the grade level and subject area of a potential beginning teacher(s)?		
2. Does the mentor candidate have expert knowledge in the same subject or endorsement area of a potential beginning teacher(s)?		
3. Does the mentor candidate demonstrate excellent classroom management skills?		
4. Is the mentor candidate regarded by colleagues as an outstanding teacher?		
5. Does the mentor candidate have confidence in his/her own instructional skills?		
6. Does the mentor candidate understand the policies and procedures of the school, district, and/or teacher's association?		
7. Does the mentor candidate collaborate well with teachers and administrators?		
8. Does the mentor candidate feel comfortable being observed?		
9. Is the mentor candidate willing to learn new teaching strategies from and with beginning teachers?		
10. Does the mentor candidate have command over evidence-based practices?		
11. Does the mentor candidate have a deep understanding of effective instructional strategies and evidence-based practices?		
12. Does the mentor candidate collect and use data to monitor progress and modify instruction accordingly?		
13. Is the mentor candidate able to support learning for a wide range of diverse students?		
14. How has the mentor candidate scored on recent performance evaluations?		
Other:		

Criteria	Use this column to list the scores of each individual on your team	Add the numbers in the second column for a total score
Communication skills		
1. Is the mentor candidate able to break down and explain effective instructional strategies?		
2. Does the mentor candidate listen attentively?		
3. Does the mentor candidate ask questions that prompt reflection and understanding?		
4. Does the mentor candidate offer feedback in positive and productive ways?		
5. Does the mentor candidate use e-mail effectively?		
6. Does the mentor candidate convey passion and enthusiasm for teaching?		
7. Is the mentor candidate discreet and able to maintain confidentiality?		
8. Can the mentor candidate provide coaching and feedback that is explicit?		
9. Does the mentor candidate understand how to scaffold support over time?		
10. Does the mentor candidate have a system for maintaining positive and effective communication with families?		
Other:		

Criteria	Use this column to list the scores of each individual on your team	Add the numbers in the second column for a total score
Interpersonal skills		
1. Is the mentor candidate able to maintain a trusting professional relationship?		
2. Does the mentor candidate know how to demonstrate care for a beginning teacher's professional and emotional needs?		
3. Is the mentor candidate attentive to sensitive political issues?		
4. Does the mentor candidate work well with individuals from different cultural backgrounds?		
5. Is the mentor candidate approachable?		
6. Is the mentor candidate able to easily establish rapport with others?		
7. Is the mentor candidate patient?		
8. Can the mentor candidate relay constructive feedback in a manner that would encourage mentees to be open, reflective, and responsive?		
Other:		

Reflection: Based on feedback from the team, which criteria should be prioritized, revised, or eliminated to create a set of mentor selection criteria for your school or district?

Center on
GREAT TEACHERS
& LEADERS

at American Institutes for Research ■

1000 Thomas Jefferson Street NW
Washington, DC 20007-3835
877.322.8700

www.gtlcenter.org

AIR ®
AMERICAN INSTITUTES FOR RESEARCH®

www.air.org

6748_01/19